

- Paris, 1932, contains An eleventh century correspondence, [the *Higashiyama ōrai*], translated and annotated by Arthur Waley, pp. 531-62.
- Untermeyer, L. A Critical Anthology. Modern American Poetry, Modern British Poetry, New York, 1936, contains three translations from the Chinese by Arthur Waley, all of which have been previously published.
- Chin P'ing Mei. The adventurous history of Hsi Men and his six wives ... With an introduction by Arthur Waley, 1939. [Translated by Bernard Miall from an abridged German version by Franz Kuhn.]
- Acton, H. Glue and Lacquer [four stories], translated by Harold Acton and Lee Yi-hsieh, with a Preface by Arthur Waley, 1941. Reprinted in 1947 with the title Four Cautionary Tales.
- Conze, E. Buddhism, its Essence and Development, 1951. Preface by Arthur Waley.
- Conze, E., ed. Buddhist Texts through the Ages, 1954. Arthur Waley was responsible for Part IV: Texts from China and Japan.
- Sitwell, E. Editor. The Atlantic Book of British and American Poetry, New York, 1958. Arthur Waley's translations are represented on pp. 1027-31.
- Gray, B., and Vincent, J. B. Buddhist Wall-paintings at Tun-Huang, 1959. Preface by Arthur Waley.

#### ADDENDA

- Van Doren, M. An Anthology of World Poetry, New York, 1928. Includes a large number of A. W.'s translations from the Chinese and Japanese.
- Edwards, E. D. The Dragon Book, 1938. Six of A. W.'s translations included.
- Trevelyan, R. C. From the Chinese, 1945. The anthology includes fifteen of A.W.'s translations.
- De Zoete, B. Dance and Drama in Bali, 1938. Preface by Arthur Waley.

## VIJAYA SANGRĀMA

by H. W. BAILEY

One of the serious lacunae of Iranian studies has been the loss of the languages of the Scythians and Sarmatians of the early first millennium B.C. We are forced to rely upon the later Saka languages to fill this gap to at least a small extent. From Khotan and Tumshuq we have manuscripts from about the 5th century to the 10th century A.D., from which many deductions can be made about the earlier stages. The Saka varieties of Iranian are now to some extent known.<sup>1</sup> It is unfortunate for the Iranian side that the Sakas of Khotan and Tumshuq had become Buddhists before our extant texts. They remembered the Harā Mountain but used the name to mean Sumeru, and the goddess Śśandrāmātā- of the earth was reduced to the equivalence of the Buddhist Śrī-devatā.<sup>2</sup>

The Saka kings who are known to us to some extent from about the 2nd century B.C. to the 10th century A.D., are shadowy figures. They have hitherto only been remembered in brief Chinese records and the legend-filled *Gostana-vyākaraṇa*,<sup>3</sup> the *Annals of Khotan*. With the slow elucidation of the indigenous texts some small part of this life has been recovered.<sup>4</sup>

Three kings of Khotan have been dated from Chinese evidence: Viśa' Saṃbhava 921-66; Viśa' Śūra 967-77 (?); Viśa' Darma 978-82 (?).<sup>5</sup>

According to the *Annals* there were two kings of the Viśa' family of the Vi Land (KT 2.55.1 *vi janivi*) called Sangrāma.

One of these was Vijaya Sangrāma, son of Vijaya Bala.<sup>6</sup> It was he who built the Vihāra called after him Bṛaḥ-sangrerema and (*ibid.* 317) Bṛa-sangrema. This name was formed from Sangrāma-ārāma-. The Khotanese name occurs in one text.<sup>7</sup> At the end of Indian names the -ārāma- was replaced in Khotanese by -ārma-, as in *saṃkhārma-* "sanghārāma-", and in

<sup>1</sup> H. W. Bailey in the *Handbuch der Orientalistik, Languages of the Saka*.

<sup>2</sup> H. W. Bailey, *Zoroastrian Problems*, p. 52 ff; *Khotanese Texts* (= KT below) I, p. 237 ff.

<sup>3</sup> This title is here used to render the Tibetan name Lihi-yul-gyi lun-bstan-pa.

<sup>4</sup> A translation of the *Annals of Khotan* is given in F. W. Thomas, *Tibetan Literary Texts* I, p. 73 ff. (= TLT below).

<sup>5</sup> E. Pulleyblank, *Asia Major*, n.s. IV, p. 94.

<sup>6</sup> TLT I, p. 123.

<sup>7</sup> Or 8212.162 (= OD below), 139, quoted in *BSOAS* 10.922, *Hvatanica* IV; KT2.8.

the loc. sing. *-erma*, later the *-m-* also is absent, as in *sakhāra*. The Vihāra was thus Khotanese *viśe'sagrārmī*, in adjectival form with suffix *-īya-*. The phrase is *viśe'sagrārmī dvīle sīvadākaraucā* "the knower of two piṭakas Sīvadākaraucā of Viśe'sagrārma". He is named after *gūśa'dī thaiya-ttika nāgaidravarda* "the bhadranta Nāgendra-varhdana of Guśam'da" and before *gūmattirai<sup>8</sup> āśa'rī virapauña* "the ācārya Virapuṇya of Gūmattira".

The second Vijaya Sangrāma was son of Vijaya Kīrti. In the Tibetan text we find (Derge 183 a 2-3):

*de-nas dehi hog-tu rgyal-po Bijaya Kīrti bu rgyal-po Bijaya Sangrama zes bgyi-ba dguo-lo bdun lon-pa zig, rgyal-por zugs-nas*. That is "after him the son of Vijaya Kīrti, Vijaya Sangrāma, aged seven years, became king".

A king Vijaya Kīrti is addressed in a short poem in Khotanese as *Viśa' Kīrttā*.<sup>9</sup> Of Vijaya Sangrāma himself the text OD has a group of verses.<sup>10</sup> He is identified as the founder of the Vihāra called *Guśam'da*. The verses were written by grateful āryas.

pvaisai ttā haṣḍā yūḍai janavai vīrāṣṭa :  
atvaḍarū drraya rana vīra beysau śāśa' :  
ṣa' tṭyai diśa' vīra pūñūdyai u pāṣai :  
beysūñai vyāraṇa nva hasta mīḍauja kīla :  
ranijai ttāja baida āvāysa sū'stai :  
gūśa'dau cū rājagrihe' hīya attikā :  
mūja ṣava ya pariyastā haudyām  
ttana kāla(na) āna vaña būrām va ttaistyai :  
cavana-jā rai hajva sājidā pūśida,  
parāha' paraihīda vasvai naṣa'rīma ṣadyū :  
haṃdarām jsām vyaucā yanīda, dara bisaga va :  
pūśida sājida askhajsā bāyīda śāśa' :  
mahāsama rāmda vī ā rāmda dīryauda rāṃṣta  
dā jsa pūñā jsa rāja-vyastām nviya  
hva hva sū'stāpda draina ranāna vaska  
sakhārma śairka jaittava jsa pakyairma  
śrī vijatta sagrauma rai hamyai pūñūda śura  
khvai hā pārrva rāṃṣta janavai vīra :  
dvāsa sala āna ṇaista rāysayam baida,  
ttana kālena ya janava thāṃrsāva bijāṃṣta,  
ttaṃḍi va sparahaudā hīna narada,  
bāstai ttañai bai'ḍa hīna jāmbvī vīra,  
sūri paiñā jsa dara jabvī pāṃṣrdai,

<sup>8</sup> Here the adjective is formed by *-aa-*, older *-aka-*.

<sup>9</sup> *MT* c.0018, edited *KT* 2.72; translated by Sten Konow in the volume dedicated to F. W. Thomas, *New Indian Antiquary*, extra series I, p. 146 f.

<sup>10</sup> Edited in *KT* I, No. 1. Anusvāras indicated by subscript hook are here omitted, but *ām* for older *ū* is kept.

khvai mī āvastai karma baśdām haṃjsāma :  
gumattira vī āraṣṭa sakhārma  
ttā daiśana āyīma śu'sta tcarṣū āvāysa  
hūḍai hā haura vasva arthū bauga :  
guśa'da nāma jaittava jsa hamaga mista  
u gūśadām bisa biśa pharāka,  
vaña bura va draya rana nvaśtā byaihīda,  
cū va varāśā'ra hvaḍa khaṣṭa panūḍai :  
ttā jsā āvāysa māṇḍa-badam-janai  
ṣai' ysini bāstai khva na jsām va harga,  
ttai ām vaña kaida, ṇaistya śāśa' burakyai :  
tcaurrvā śāmvā pvāha' kījsanū bvaiysa,  
mista sīma mista ayai valekyai pharākyai,  
phaṣupāḍañña nālā gaṃtsa mista,  
ñānarthā pāṣa prravaitta  
ramanī tcaṣū paima bisai  
jista bai'ysa satvām ttrvāyāka :  
khvai vījsyāra satta naphanīda tsāṣta jsa,  
ciyai vījsyāvai ṣa' satsāra jsa thyau gūsta :  
tcaurrvā śāmvā hvāhye mista saragyai,  
bai'sūm bauspaujañña ranīnai stūpa :  
cāvām tta tta daitta khu raṃnā male ttraikha :  
pūñūda va satta ysatha upapattī nāsīdā,  
śajsāva prravaja nāda prraṇahaunā kaiṇa :

Every text in this language still presents difficulties; the following notes are necessary before a translation is made.

1. (line 15) *pvaisai* "I request" for older *\*pulse*, 1st sing. middle. The speaker is not described, either by name or title.
2. (15) *haṣḍa-* "petition", equivalent to the Ind. *vijñapti-* (frequent in Prakrit forms in Kroraina texts).
3. (15) *atvaḍarū*, P 2787.29 *ūtvaḍarūttara*, 68 *ūtvaḍarūttama*, Siddhasāra 8 r 1 *utvaḍare jsa* rendering Sansk. *ādhiḥyāt*, P 3513, 45 v 2 *atvaḍirūve* (*KT* 1.223), *ibid.* 57 v 1 *pīrmāttami utvaḍirūve* rendering Sansk. *atīva viśiṣṭam*, *ibid.* 53 v 2 *utvaḍa* and *ibid.* 54 v 3 *tvāḍa* seems to be the N-W Prakrit *utvara-* which in the Dharmapada B 37 (*BSOAS* 11.500) corresponds to *uttara-*. To *-ara-* the comparative *-tara-* is added giving *-aḍara-*. The Khotanese *ttuvar-*, *tvar-* in *tvare* "exceedingly" may have caused contamination.
4. (16) *pāṣai*, and line 28 *pāṣa* is older *pārṣṣa-* "reverend" as in Kha 1.306a, 5 v 5 (KBT 8) *tīrā buri uvāra pārṣṣa puñāuda maṃgaliya ttathāgatta* "these so many noble reverend meritorious auspicious tathāgatas".

5. (16) *vyāraṇa*, Bud. Sansk. *vyākaraṇa*, the utterance of a Buddha, often in the shape of a prophecy. The verb gave in Khotanese older *vyāgar-*, *vyātar-*, later *vyār-*, *vār-* and *vyir-*.
6. (16) *hasta* represents a form from older *hastama-* "best" or *hastara-* "better", as *Asia Major*, n.s., 2.30.
7. (16) *kīla* occurs only here so far, possibly from a Prakrit \**kela-* from *kalya-* "good", Pali *kalya-*, *kalla-*, in type like *-era-* from *-arya-*, as in Pali *acchera* "āścarya-" and *macchera-* "mātsarya-". It seems hardly a form of *kṛidā-* "play" in this context.
8. (16) *ranījai ttāja* is the river of Khotan the "river of precious stone", that is, the jade. The modern Turkish names are *Qara Qaş* and *Yörüng Qaş*, rivers of black and white jade. Buddhist texts had *Śailodā*, see *BSOAS* 10.91 f.
9. (17) *āvāysa-* "dwelling", and below 24, 26, is the Buddhist *āvāsa-*, the abode of the bhikṣus.
10. (17) *sū'sta-* and 21, 24, pres. *sū'ha-* "prepare", used of the preparation of the elixir to restore Rāma (KT 3.75 and 65 *raysāyam sū'stāṃda thyau* "they swiftly prepared the elixir").
11. (17) *gūśa'dau* here as 25 *gūśadām*, seems to be gen. plural to *gūśam'daa-* adjective. In 25 *gūśa'da* is the noun. The adj. in *-iya-* gave KT 2.5.66 *gūśa'dī*, P 2958, 182 *gūśa'dī*, P 2786. 126, 135 *gūśadī*, P. 2786. 122 (KT 2.97) *gūśam'dī*, *ibid.* 36 *gvāśam'dī*, *ibid.* 122 *gvāśa'dī*. This *-iya-* is familiar also in Bud. Sanskrit.
- This name occurs in the Tibetan Annals of Khotan Derge and Narthang *hgu-šan*, Derge 183 b 1 *dgu-šan-ta*, Narthang *hgu-šan-ta* (TLT 1.122), and in a Tibetan document *gu-šan-do* (TLT 2.183). The translation *ži-bahi sa* "place of quiet" indicates that the word is N-W. Prakrit *vaśada* from older *upaśānta* "tranquil", see *BSOAS* 11.509, Dharmapada O 25, 26. The initial *va-* has then been replaced by *gu-*, and later *gvā*.
12. (17) *attikā*, compared with 25 *jaittava jsa hamaga* "equal to Jetavana" gives a similar meaning for *attika-*. P 2787.96 *jaṣṭi ba'ysai hīya attika* "equal to the Buddha" has the same word. Here the context requires *jaṣṭi*, with *-i-* written like long *-ā-* (KBT ix). The Gostana Sanskrit has *adika* in *BSOAS* 9.527 (KT 3.124.79) *madīlīyana rajsa-pāṭtra-griha'na adika astī* "my cell is the equal of the prince's palace" (so to explain it). This then gives Sansk. *antika-*, with secondary *-i-* from short *-i-*. Note the case of *līyana-* from \**liyana-* from *layana-*.
13. (17) *mūja šava ya* "it was the abode, the possession". Older *mūṃja* from *mān-* "dwell" occurs in similar use in P 2893.9 (KT 3.82) of Bhaiṣajyarāja's place in Banācvā. The usual *šavā-* "night" does not suit

here. Hence it is likely to be connected with *šsau* "ruler", originally "owner", and *kṣuṇa-* "rule"<sup>11</sup>; it is then *šavā-* (from older \**šavā-*) "possession" with the meaning of Rigveda *kṣó :* *kṣú-*, ultimately the *-eu-* base beside the *-ei-* base in Avestan *ššay-* "to possess, rule", *Šuynī šay-* "ruler", Old Ind. *kṣay-* with *kṣatrá-* (*-i-* absent).

The position of *ya* "was", older *vāta-*, can be seen also in S 5212 b 6 (KT 2.130) *pharāka ya hvāṇḍa*, and here in line 22.

14. (17) *parīyastā haudyām* "of the āryas seven". The genitive plural of numerals was older *-inu*, *-enu*, later *-yem* *-ye*, *-em*, *-ai*, *-yām*, *-ām* as KT 4 Hedin 46 a 2 *paṃjem*, 39 a 2 *tcahaurye*, Or 11252.38.3 *haudyem*, P 3513, 74 v 1 *paṃjai*, P 2949.6, 12 *paṃjām*, P 2958.121 *tcīhauryam*.

The word *parīyasta-* formed from *parīya-* "deliverance" with adj. suffix *-asta-* was used for "ārya", the polite word for *bhikṣu*, as in *ārya-saṃgha-*, and with further adj. suffix *-āna-* occurs in P 3513, 61 v 1 (KT 1.242, Sansk. 3.7) *ttira parīyastānyau jsa šṣahānyau uspurra ide* rendering Sansk. *yathaiva sarvāryagunopapannāḥ*. The story of the Seven Āryas is told in the Annals,<sup>12</sup> Derge 183 a 7:

*hphags-pa dgra-bcom-pa poñanareta-la sogs-pa hphags-pa bdun-gyi phyr hgu-šan-gyi gčug-lag-khaṇ brčigs-te, hphags-pa dgra-bcom-pa bdun-gyis kyaṇ vog sa de byin-gyis brlabs-nas, ži-bahi sa dgu-šan-ta žes bgyi-bar gčug-lag-khaṇ-gi mčhan-ma yaṇ brtags-te, gčug-lag-khaṇ hdi yaṇ gñan-žin byin che rab-ste, lha jīnarišaba dan, nor-bu-bzaṇ-po gñis-kwis srub-wo.*

For *Poñanareta* the Narthang text has *Poñenareta*. It may be from *Puṇyanarendra*. For Derge *Dgu-šan-ta* the Narthang text has *Hgu-šan-ta*.

15. (18) *cavana-jā* has been taken as Bud. Sansk. *cyavana-jāti-* "transmigration and birth", with *jā* as in Khotan. *jā-smara-* from *jāti-smara-*. The verb *cav-* occurs in E 23.306 *cavindā*, 24.108 *cavāte*. This assumes that *rai* is a particle, as P2787. 94 (KT 2.104) *tta tta rai ra*.
16. (19) *vyauca*, from the context "check, hindrance". It can be connected with P 2790.134 (KT 3.63) *pyauca* "hindrance", Hoernle 23.12 *pyaucamgāra-* "causing hindrance". This gives two preverbs *vy-* or (*a*)*by-* and *pati-* with *-auca*. Possibly it is connected with Zor. Pahlavi *patkōp-*.
17. (20) *askhajsā* "elevation"; in the Siddhasāra 7 v 1 *iskhajsā* renders Sansk. *abhyudaya-*. The verb present is *uskhaja-*. The participle

<sup>11</sup> In *šsau* I now see older *šava-*, nom. gen. sing. *šsau*. In the Kuśān *šaonana šao* the gen. plur. *šaonano* has been made on a base \**šaun-* which could represent older \**šāvan-* : *šāun-* like Khotan. *rrāysan-*. In Khotan. *kṣuṇa-* I now see direct \**ššu-na-*, not a secondary *kṣu-* from Khotan. \**ššyū-* from older *ššāva-* (against *BSOAS* 12, p. 327ff).

<sup>12</sup> Translation of the Narthang text in TLT I, p. 122.

- uskhasta-* which it was proposed to join here in *BOSAS* 10.898, is, however, rather to be taken with *naṣkhasta-*, from a base *khah-* : *khasta-*.
18. (20) *mahāsama*, here with anusvāra on the last syllable instead on *sa*, occurs in the legend KT 2.53.9 *mahāsaṃma*, the name of the first Buddhist king *Mahāsammata*.
  19. (21) *rāja-vyastām* is comparable to P 2787.147 (KT 2.107) *rāja-sāstra-vyasthā*. It contains a form of Bud. Sansk. *vyusthāna-* "rise". The Bud. Sanskrit kept the *-sth-*, see *JRAS* 1955.14. Here "practice, custom" or "requirement" would suit.
  20. (21) *jāittava jsa pakyairma* "equal to Jetavana". Below 25 *jāittava jsa hamaga*. The word *pakyairma* occurs also in Ch 00266.362 (KBT 111) *bajāsa paśve jsa pakyerma*, and below P 2787.109 *tīśa' jsa pakairma*, P 2027.52 *lāhūra āśi' jsa pakyairma* "equal to the ārya Rāhula". The name Jetavana occurs in several forms: E 21.9 *jīyavanā*; loc. sing. *jātakastava* 19 v 1 *jīyabañi*, P 2834.6 (KBT 45) *jettavaña sakhyerma*.
  21. (21) *śrī vijatta sagrauma rai* "king Śrī Vijita Sangrāma". P 2787.51 *śrī vijatta sagrāma* and 62 *śrī viśa' sagrāma*. Kroraina Prakrit has *vij'ida*. It was the family name of the kings of Khotan, an adjectival name *viśa'*, in Tib. *bža*, from the *Vi* Land. It was Indianized as *Vijaya* and *Vijita*. Fuller details are in KT 4, introduction (now with the Printer).
  22. (22) *pārrva* "transferred, awarded", frequent in business documents, from a base *par-nu-*. Details in KT 4.
  23. (22) *rāysayam* for the usual *rāysāyam* modified from Bud. Sansk. *rājāsana-* "royal throne", assimilated to Khotan. *rrāysan-* "ruler", *rāysaunda-* "ruling", Avestan *rāzan-* "rule".
  24. (23) *thāmrsāva bijāmṭta*, the collocation with *bajautta-* "damaged" indicates that the word is pejorative. In the Sudhana avadāna Ch 00266.71 (KBT 23) *thaurasā*, P 2025.121 (KBT 15) *thausāva* means "oppressed". In P 2891.30 (KT 3.80) *thāmrsā* is used of a "hard" stone. The older form *thūrsā* occurs in P 2787.87 (KT 2.104).
  25. (23) *jambvī vīra*, the story of an expedition to Jambudvīpa is told of Vijaya Kīrti in the Annals of Khotan (TLT 1.119) in the time of Kanika.
  26. (24) *āvastai* "disliked, rejected, removed"; the meaning is won from Kha 1.13, 147 v 3 (KBT 7) *kya pabanu nā* (so read) *jīśāñātāndū vāta*, *u īskya nā āvasta vāta* "did not dislike the nexus and did not disapprove of returning". The Tibetan rendering has *slar hjug hdod-par gyur-ba* "desire to return"; the Chinese text similarly. The phrase has been turned by a negative in Khotanese, and in double translation. The word

*āvastaa-* occurs also in KBT 153.29 and 152.13. It may be a derivative of *vād-* "thrust" with *ā-* "on, against", that is Avestan *vādaya-* and Old Ind. *bādh-*.

27. (24) *hamjsāma* "bringing together", occurring also in P 3513, 26 r 2 (KBT 57) *samāhānām hīvī hamjsāma ṣṭe*. The participle is *hamjsaunda-*, which renders Sansk. *arjita-* "acquired" in P 3515, 73 v 4.
28. (24) *gūmattūra*, a frequent name of a place near Khotan. See *New Indian Antiquary*, extra series I, p.1, and *Asia Major*, n.s., II 26.
29. (24) *āraṣṭa* "erected", so far found only here, from *ā-rāz-*, with other preverbs *varāś-* and *birāys-*. Ossetic has *ārāzun*, *ārāst* "erect, prepare, dress, adorn, plant", with intransitive *ārāzun*.
30. (24) *daiśana āyima* "in desire of teaching", Bud. Sansk. *deśanā-*. In *āyima* lies loc. sing. of *ātama-* "desire". The longing for a *subhāṣita-* occurs in many jātika tales.
31. (25) *arthū bauga*, Bud. Sansk. *artha-* and *bhoga-*, "wealth" and "things to enjoy". Similarly P 4099.151 (KBT 120) *arthū bāuga* P 2783.93 (KT 3.76) *arthabaugā*.
32. (25) *bīsa* "servants", Avestan *vaēsa-*, rather than a later form of *bisā-* "house".
33. (25) *nvaštā* "contemplation"; *nvaštāmatā-* renders Bud. Sansk. *vyupa-parikṣaṇa* in Or 9609, 4 r 4 (KT 1.233).
34. (26) *māṇḍa-badaṃ-janai* is still uncertain. The word *māṇḍa-* could represent Khot. *munḍa-* "lump"; Bud. Sansk. *munḍa-* "shaven", or *māḍa-* "balcony". This is Pali *māla-*, *māla-*. See *BSOS* 8.619 ff., F. Edgerton, *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Dictionary*, s.v.; and *JRAS* 1955.21.  
In *bada-* may be concealed Ind. *bandha-* "binding, putting together" In *janaa-* may lie Ind. *janaka-* "producing" or *jana-* "production" with *-ka-* in the compound.
35. (26) *ysinī bāstai* "take under one's care", older E *ysinīta-*, *ysinīya-*, whence Kroraina *jheniḡa-*, *jheniya-*; in Sogdian *zynyh*. It belongs to Avestan *zaēna-* "watching", the *jēnya-* of the Rīgveda (F. W. Thomas, *JRAS* 1946, 4 ff.; but Kroraina *jh-* represents *z-*, not Ind. *j-*).
36. (27) *harga* "tax", Kroraina *harga* as in the phrase 141 *palīi hargā* (*palīi*, older *balī*). Khotanese *hargā* is both adjective and noun, in three meanings: 1. "discarded" with the verb *yan-* "make", as Jātakastava 9 r 1-2 *yuḍe hargā* "he abandoned" and *pā na yuḍai hargā* "you did not discard". With *padīm-* occurs *hargā padīmāre* "they make discharge" in Siddhasāra 17 v 5 *saṃnā hargā padīmāre*, Tib. *phyi-sa bde-bar hbyun-ba*. 2. "freed" in P 2787.116 *hargā tsida tta naṣi mārai* "they become free,

they are quieted". This is required also in P 3513, 71 r 3-4 (KT 1.247) *tī harbišā harga hamānde byehīde pve'nyau gvaštā* "they all become free, they reach separation from fears" where the original Bud. Sanskrit has *te sarvi sattva vyasanāgata-duḥkhitāni mucyantu tair bhaya-śataih paramaiḥ sughoraiḥ* (hence *harga* is not the rendering of *vyasana*-); 3. "tax" here and the loan-word in Kroraina. In this sense the word passed to Armenian *hark* "tribute, tax", and thence to Georgian *xark'*-i.<sup>13</sup>

Related are two Turfan words Mid. Pers. *hrg bryd \*h(a)rāy barēd* "he pays taxes" with two dots over the *r* (Andreas-Henning, *Mitteliranische Manichaica* II, p. 15, line 16) and *hrg \*hary* or *hray* or *hrāy* "rejected stuff, refuse" (W. B. Henning, *Sogdica* 56).

In three Iranian dialects occur *-rā-* instead of or as by-forms of *-ar-* before consonant. In Khotanese, *grāma-* "hot" stands beside *garma-* in the compound *garma-māštāa-* "oppressed by heat" (*BSOAS* 21.523). In Mid. Parthian<sup>14</sup> *gr'b \*grāβ* "womb" corresponds to Avestan *garəwa-*, Zor. Pahl. *garβ*, *gaβr*. In Ossetic *bālāsā* "tree" can be explained from *\*vrāša-* beside Avestan *varəša-*. Hence Turfan *hrg* may be *\*hrāy* equivalent to *\*harya-* or *\*hrāy* from older *\*hrāka-*. NPers.-Arab *xarāj* "tax" could come from this Mid. Iranian *\*hrāga-*. It would then be independent of the Semitic Biblical Aramaic *hlk \*halāk*, and Akkad. *ilku* (W. B. Henning, *Orientalia* 4.291).

The base of Khotan. *harga* is *hark-* attested in Avestan *hark-* "emitter". From Old Indian belongs here Rīgveda *ṣṛkā-* "missile". *VS* 16.61 *ṣṛkāhasta-* "holding a missile". The word *ṣṛnkā-* occurring only twice, is in Katha Upaniṣad 1.16 and 2.3. Here "tribute, gift" makes good sense as in 1.16 *ṣṛnkām cemām anekarūpām gṛhāṇa* "and take this manifold gift".<sup>15</sup> A base *sark-* was unknown to the later commentators, hence such interpretations as "necklace" or "road". The meaning of Khotanese *harga* "tax" justifies this explanation of *ṣṛnkā-*.

Since the meanings of OInd. *sark-*, Avestan *hark-*, OInd. *sarg-* in *sarga-s* "discharge" and OInd. *sarj-* Avestan *harz-* are like, it is probable that they represent one base with three different determinatives: *-k-*, *-g-*, *-ḡ-*. I would now similarly see two determinatives *-k-* and *-g-* in Rīgveda *ark-*: *ṛk-* "celebrate" and *ṛgmīn-*, *ṛgmīya-* hence *ark-* beside *\*arg-*: elsewhere *-k-* before *-m-* is kept (see *Indo-Iranian Journal* II, 152). The Khotanese *āljs-* "sing" may come from either

<sup>13</sup> H. Adjarian, *Etymological Armenian Dictionary*, connected with *harkanem* "strike"; N. Adontz, *Armenia in the time of Justinian*, 483 derived Armen. *hark* from Arab-Pers. *xarāj*.

<sup>14</sup> M. Boyce, *BSOAS* 13, p. 912.

<sup>15</sup> C. Bartholomae, AIW compared *hark-* with OInd. *ṣṛkā-*; and I. Scheftelowitz connected *hark-* and *ṣṛnkā-* in *ZII* 2, p. 278.

*ark-* or *arg-*. Armen. *erg* might be an early loan-word from Iranian when Iranian short *-ar*, final or before a consonant, was rendered by *er*, as in *anvauer*, *der*, *handerdz*. But Armen. *ergo-* might perhaps represent direct Indo-European *\*erko-*.

Tax-free *viḥāras* are known to Uigur (Türkische Turfan-Texte 6.56).

37. (27) *naistya śāśa'* "at the end of the Law" (see E. Lamotte, *Histoire du bouddhisme indien*, I, p. 217 ff.). The construction (like *urbs media*) occurs elsewhere Siddhasāra 3 r 4 *na'styi pasālā rva* "the season at end of spring", reversed *ibid.* 3 v 1 *ysumi na'styi biśā rva* "the season at the end of winter" (KT 1.6 and BSOS 8.930 f.). P 2787, 107 has *nai'styai vaśāvāysa* "end of the residence of the rainy season".
38. (27) *tcaurrvā śāmvā*, and line 30 "in four mukha", here perhaps four entrances.
39. (37) *pvāha* "dwelling" from *\*pa(ti)-vāha-*, like *gvaha-* "abode" from *\*vivaha-*. In the Jātakstava 32 r 1, *ysāysīṇa gvahaṇa* "in a hut of grass" corresponds in meaning to P 2893.11 (KT 2.82) *ttriṇa-śela*, loc. sing. The *āvāysa-* above was similar in Old Indian.
40. (27) *kīsanū* is either *\*kīsanā* with *u* "and", or *\*kīsanūnā* with adjectival suffix *-ūna-* added to adjective as in *māñandūna-*. It is some meliorative epithet associated with *bvaiysa-* "long", used of a dwelling. Possibly it derives from *\*kaṣa-* or *\*karṣa-*, hence *\*ka(r)ṣanya-*, passed to *kīšana-*. Armen. *k'āṣ* "excellent", or Sogdian *karš* might be connected. It could also be from *\*kaičana-* or *\*kaiṣana-* "distinguished" from the *kaik-* or *kaig-* in Zor. Pahl. *nikēš-*, *nikēxtan* "to account, explain", with Khotan. *chīyā* "counting" (KT 4, Hedin 4.11), Ossetic *xincun* "to count". Differently evolved is *bviysna* from *\*bujnya-* from *\*baṣanya-* "intoxicant".
41. (27) *mista sīma* "great boundary" or compound "having a great boundary", with Sansk. *sīmā-*, as also in P 2893.21 (KT 3.83) *ca kṣī'ra sīma dījsāre* "who hold the boundary of the land". This is a "boundary, limit" or the area within boundaries.
42. (27) *mista ayai* in hendiadys with *mista sīma*. As often the same idea is expressed by an Indian word and by the equivalent Khotanese. This *ayai* occurs only here. If it means "area within limits" it recalls Greek, Homeric *aīa* "earth". The Khotanese intervocalic *-y-* may, however, have replaced *-d-* and possibly some other consonant. If the word has original *-y-*, it could be traced to an early Iranian nominal base *āy-*: *ay-* comparable with *āp-* *ap-* "water" or *āh-* "mouth" (Old Ind. *ās-* with suffix *āsyā-*), in Khotanese with a suffixed *-ai* from *-aka-*. Evidence to decide among various possibilities is still lacking.

43. (28) *valekyai pharākyai* seems to be rather "so great, many" than *valaka-* "only so much, little".
44. (28) *phaṣu-pādañā* is not clear. It might contain *phaṣu-* from Prakrit \**phāṣu-* "pleasant", attested in Aśoka and Pali *phāsu-*, Khot. *phāṣa-* (*Transactions Philol. Soc.* 1955, 154) from \**sparsu-*. Incidentally note that Sansk. *komalā-* "soft" might similarly contain the base *skau-*: *sku-* "touch", this being a better connection than with *kau-* "to hew" (*BSOAS* 21.528). If the *phaṣu-* is Prakrit, possibly *pādañā-* is so too. Then *pādana-* might be a form of *paṭṭana-* "place, town", or connected with Sansk. *patana-*, found in the name *Rṣipatana-*, and *Rṣivadana-*. Then *pādana-* would have the Prakrit *paḍ-* from older *pat-*.
45. (28) *nālā gaṃtsa* or *nālām gaṃtsa*. Unexplained. The first word can be compared to the *nālā-* of *nālā-viraṃ* rendering Sansk. *nāḍi-vraṇa-*. In *gaṃtsa* could be found an Indian *kaṃsa* or *-gaṃsa-* with the *mts* from *ms*. The word *nālā-* meant Sansk. *nāṭaka-* "drama".
46. (28) *ñānartha-* "having knowledge of the matter" occurs several times. In P 2787.153 (*KT* 2.107) occurs *ñānarthe ke'na*. Older is *nyānartha* (Iledong o6 b 2, *KT* 3.133). Kroraina has *ñātartha* and *ñadartha* with the expected *jñāta-*.
47. (29) *paima bisai* "resident in the image", with *paima*, P 2026. 83 *pema*, P 2026.67 *pe'mau* gen. plur. from Bud. Sansk. *pratimā* (*BSOAS* 10.906).
48. (29) *naphanāda* "they rejoice" (so to read) from *phan-*, as *paphan-* "rejoice". For *phan-* see *Transactions Philol. Soc.* 1956, 118 ff., and *Journal of the K.R. Cama Oriental Institute*, No. 38, 1958, 131. The Rīgveda *pānīphaṇat*, participle present, (*RV* 4.40.4) is used of a racing horse. Armen. *patouhan* is from \**pati-fāna-* "sluice, chimney, window". The proposal to seek in *patouhan* an Iranian *frāna-* "breath" (taken to mean "wind") ignores the other meanings of the word, see E. Benveniste, *BSL* 53, 63.
49. (30) *gūṣṭa*, 3rd sing. pres. from *gūs-* "escape" used to render the Bud. Sansk. base *mok-* "release". See *BSOAS* 10.900.
50. (30) *saragyai*, taken here as gen. sing. (the *-gyai* could also represent older *-ge* nom. plur.) can be traced to an older \**saragā-*. This *sar-* is then to be seen in Old Ind. *śaraṇa-* "refuge", *śarman-* "protection" and *śālā-* "room", Latin *cella* and the rest. Possibly here belongs Mid. West Iran. \**srāda-* "hall" attested in Zor. Pahl. *srāḍ* (H. W. Bailey, *Zoroastrian Problems* 106), NPers. *sarāy*, Armen. *srah*; *srahak* "veil" Mandaean *srd'q* "tent cover", Arab. *surādiq* "curtain". A similar form is \**zrāda-* "armour". Avestan *zrāda-*, from *zar-* "cover". A further

Khotanese word for Sansk. *śālā-* is *śārṣṭaa-*, later *śāṣṭaa-* in the compound *jāya-śāṣṭaa-* for *prahāṇa-śālā-* (*BSOAS* 15.532 and *JRAS* 1955, 24, note 2). Possibly this too contains *sar-* but with *ś-* due to a secondary palatalisation.

51. (30) *bai'sūṃ bauspaujañā* seems to me now to contain *balsa-* "stūpa" with adjectival suffix *-ūna-*, as in *dahūna-* "of a man", rather than *-ū* "and". This passage was quoted in *BSOAS* 21.541. The *bauspauja-* is written also *KT* 3.3.9 r 2 *bū-spāmja* to render the Bud. Sansk. *gan-dhakuṭi* "perfume-chamber", Tibetan from Prakrit *gandhola*. The *bū-* is from older \**bauda-* "perfume" and *-spāmja* is connected with Mid. Iranian *spanč-* "to entertain", NPers. *sipañ* "inn", Georgian *maspin-dzeli* "host", Armen. *asprjakan*, Sogd. *spnč-* with *-č-*. Khotanese shows that the word has *sp-*, not *ṣu-*. The word is also in P 2787.97 *būspājā* and P 2026. 73 gen. plur. *bauspājā*, 79 *bauspājām*.
52. (31) *cāvām* here only, if it is *cāvāna-*, possibly rendering Bud. Sansk. *kūṭa-* "pinnacle", Prakrit *kūla*, see *BSOAS* 21.541.
53. (32) *male* "peak" in *BSOAS* 21.541-2, either the same as the *-mala* of *kamala-* "head", Avestan *kaṃarāda-*, or from a base *mal-* "to project".
54. (32) *ysatha upapattī* in hendiadys, occurring also in P 2787. 144 (*KT* 2.106) *ysatha upapattā*.
55. (32) *śajsāva* "solitary, one, single". It occurs in Jīvaka-pustaka 54 r 3 (*KT* 1.145) *śajsām pajivām gvahaiye* "hemiplegia".
56. (32) *pravaṇja* from Bud. Sansk. *pravrajyā*. E has *pravajjā-* and *pravvajjā-*.
57. (32) *nāda* "they took", older *nāndā*.

#### TRANSLATION

I beg to make a petition to my land, still more to the Buddhas' Doctrine based on the three jewels. This (land) is in this region holy and reverend, according to prophecy of the Buddha most excellent, gracious, and favourable. By the Jade River he prepared the dwelling for the people of Guśa'da, which is the equal of Rājagṛha. It has been the abode, and possession of the Seven Āryas. From that time till now it has stood for them. The wise study and read of passing on and birth, they practise the rules, pure, clean, with devotion. To other acts they offer hindrance for the whole Bhikṣusangha. They read and study and guide the Doctrine to its exaltation. From Mahāsammatā the king, the kings have held rule with the Law and with holy acts according to the need of state, each by himself prepared for the three jewels good sanghārāmas equal to Jetavana. King Śrī Vijita Sangrāma arose, meritorious and bold. When the kingdom was awarded to him twelve years he sat on the throne. At that time the land was oppressed and ruined.

Then seventy-seven troops of them went forth, he led a troop to Jambudvīpa. By valour, by his powers he vanquished all Jambudvīpa. When he had rejected his mass of evil karma, in Gumattira he erected the sanghārāma. Thus in desire of the teaching he made splendid the dwelling, he gave to it gifts, pure wealth and things to enjoy. It was by name Guśa'da equal to Jetavana, and huge; and all the many inmates are of the people of Guśa'da. Till now on the three jewels there they ponder, they who enjoy the food and drink every day. Thus indeed he took under his care the dwelling, product of the building of the halls, so that they had no tax at all. Now so they protect it up to the end of the Doctrine. In the four entrances stands a mansion rich and long, a great bounded area, a great space, so large, abundant, the Phaṣupādāna Nālāgamtsa. Learned and reverend are the ascetics, delightful and splendid is the image, the deva buddha therein is saviour of men. When men see it, they rejoice with happiness. When one sees it he escapes swiftly from transmigration. In the four entrances of the wide pavilion stands the Gandhakuṭi of the stūpa, a stūpa of jewels, the pinnacle appears like the peak and mountain-top of the mountain of jewels. There holy men take birth and origin, they take up the solitary homeless life under their vows.

## 2

The Khotanese text P 2797 (KT 2.101 ff.), a religious document, devotes large part to the praise of a king Viśa' Sangrāma. From the quotation from OD above it would seem that Viśa' Sangrāma son of Vijaya Kīrti was especially renowned. It is likely therefore that the king of P 2787 was this Sangrāma although no certain identifying reference to him has been found. The text of P 2787 is printed in *Khotanese Texts* II; it is too long to repeat in full here. Instead three passages are rendered. The whole text is more eloquent in style than others preserved in Khotanese. On the king as Bodhi-sattva see *Asia Major*, n.s., II 25.

## I. 26-37.

"With intent to offer worship and attendance (*pūjopasthāna*) to the all-best cosmic appearance (*utpatti*) of deva-buddhas here-dwelling present epiphanous in the ten regions, according to the request invocation and invitation<sup>16</sup> of the Sacred Lord<sup>17</sup> Gracious Deva who is (like) the rising of

<sup>16</sup> *dastana* is taken in this triadic phrase as inst. sing. with -na only after the three words. The triad limits *dasta-* to a meaning "making known". It may then contain the *dasta-* of Gatha Avestan *dastvām* (Yasna 46.7) acc. sing. "instruction". It belongs with the *dasta-* of Zor. Pahl. *dastabar* "bearer of instruction, teacher" with the technical use of -bara-, NPers. *dastūr*; Old Ind. *damś-* : *das-* used of skills.

<sup>17</sup> *śai-kū* from Chinese 聖君 K 1205, 507 *śaṅg-kūn* from *śiāṅg-hiuan*, elsewhere P 2787.61 *śaina-kūna*, 51 *śi-kū*, 83 *śai-kū*, P 3510.7.4, KBT 52 *śim-kūn*.

the sun of the Vinaya of the preaching of the Buddhas' Law, guide on the ways to the deva-kṣetra and the buddha-kṣetra, destroyer of the darkness of torpidity of beginningless time and epoch, complete with illumination from 100,000 rays of Great Pity (*mahākaruṇā*) of the million (*koṭi*) 100,000 cāturdvīpa (Worlds of four continents) from the rays of the nirmāṇa-kāya (transformation body) brilliant and gold-coloured<sup>18</sup> in the palaces of cosmic circles made of the sambhoga-kāya (body of fruition) of the splendour (*tejas*) delightful, holy,<sup>19</sup> shining and unfailing beyond the rays of the full moon on the full month (day) upon the Haraysa (*Harā byṣ*) of the circle of space (*ākāśa-maṇḍala*) in the sphere of essence (*dharmadhātu*) purified from the mass of wind, mist and smoke, separated from<sup>20</sup> afflictions (*kleśa*), pure, foremost stainless clear, shining, brilliant, extended,<sup>21</sup> large<sup>22</sup> and vast in the regions and sub-regions . . . ."

## 2. 43-52.

"With intent to elevate the nexus of noble divine long threefold life of the Sacred Lord Śrī Vijita Sangrāma king of kings more abundantly here in the Jade Land ruling, protected by the four Lokapālas of golden-colour,<sup>23</sup> (the king) seated on the royal seat (*rājāsana*) under golden-budded jewel-handled white (flame-coloured) umbrella, with splendour (*tejas*) brilliant with Fortune like Śakra king of Devas, like a fifth Lokapāla protector of the Golden Land and the Jade Land."

## 3. 59-66.

"As much as upon the *pāṇḍu-kambala-śilā* stone seat Śakra king of Devas, surrounded with his divine retinue, enjoys of happiness, bliss and fortune, to that extent here in the Jade Land may this imperial (*cakravartin*) Fortune of kings of the Sacred Lord Gracious Deva Śrī Vijita Sangrāma shine out in all the ten regions. May the deva-buddhas thus bless that they maintain the Jade Land with the Law, the multitude of devī queens, princes

<sup>18</sup> *ysāryai* has been taken as connected with Avestan *zāri-* "yellow".

<sup>19</sup> *śadāva* is here taken as from an older *śanda-* with the adjectival suffix -āva-, as in *rraysāva-* "empty". That is the *śśanda-* occurring in Khotan. *śśandā* "earth" and *ysama-śśandai* "people" rendering Sansk. *loka-*. The cognate is Avestan *spanta-* and West Iranian *sanda-*.

<sup>20</sup> Similarly P 3513, 76 v 3 *āsta naiṣṭe jsa pahaṣṭa darśana-maurga* "the path of *darśana*-theory separated from being and not-being".

<sup>21</sup> *haṣṭa* "extended" in the triadic expression frequent in this text, from a base *as-* "to extend up to, reach". This is *ans-* : *as-*, Old Ind. *amś-* : *as-*, participle -*aṣṭa-*. The Avestan *aṣti-* "measure of length, 4 fingers' breadth" and *uzaṣti-* "8 fingers' breadth", and *aṣti.masah-* "of the size of an *aṣti-*" are derived from this same base, as Avestan *vītaṣti-* "a span" is from *tan-s-*. The measures are identified in W. B. Henning, *Transactions Philol. Soc.*, 1948, p. 68.

<sup>22</sup> *āvāḍa-* here between *haṣṭa-* "extended" and *vaishṭhārya-* "vast" may mean "large". It occurs in P 3510.4.10 (KBT 50) *biśā aspaurā āvāḍa* "all full large". It may contain *ā-pār-* "to fill".

<sup>23</sup> Reading *ysara-gūnyai*.

and princesses in all time to be happy healthy prosperous, with intent that here in the Jade Land there should be success and prosperity in all harvests of the Law for the people good, low and middle.

"To-day on this evening there is the preaching of the noble (*āysñā*, as Avestan *āsna*-, Armenian loan-word *azniu*) profound Law of ultimate truth."

It will be seen how the thoughts of the orator are clothed in an Indian garment.

## LIEH-TZŪ AND THE DOVES: A PROBLEM OF DATING

by DERK BODDE

Concerning the dating of the Taoist work *Lieh-tzŭ* 列子 there is, as is well known, a wide divergence of opinion, for whereas most Western scholars accept it as a work of the third century B.C., modern Chinese scholarship tends to regard it as a forgery of the third or fourth century A.D. Among the passages used to support the latter dating is that from chapter eight, describing the release of living doves on New Year's day, in which some scholars believe there is a Buddhist influence. The passage in question, whose setting is the city of Han-tan (capital of the state of Chao) in the fifth century B.C., reads as follows:<sup>1</sup>

The people of Han-tan (had the habit), on New Year's day, of presenting (live) doves to Chien-tzŭ.<sup>2</sup> This greatly pleased Chien-tzŭ, who liberally rewarded those (who made the donations). To a stranger who asked the meaning of this (custom), Chien-tzŭ explained that the release of living creatures (*fang-shêng* 放生) on New Year's day was a manifestation of kindness. "But," said the stranger, "if the people, knowing of Your Lordship's desire to release them, compete with one another in catching them, those that die in the process must indeed be numerous. If you really wish to let them live, the best way would be to prohibit the people from catching them at all. For if they have to be caught in order to be released, the kindness does not compensate for the cruelty." Chien-tzŭ acknowledged that he was right.

Another less developed version of the same story appears in the seventeenth chapter of *K'ung Ts'ung-tzŭ* (a work of Later Han or post-Han date); in it sparrows (*ch'iao* 雀) take the place of doves (*chiu* 鳩), and the setting, while still Han-tan, is shifted from the fifth to the third century B.C.:<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Translation slightly modified from that of L. Giles, *Taoist Teachings from the Book of Lieh Tzŭ* (London, 2nd printing, 1925), pp. 118, 119.

<sup>2</sup> I.e., Chao Chien-tzŭ 趙簡子, head of the Chao clan in the state of Chin, who died in 458 B.C. See E. Chavannes, *Mémoires historiques de Se-ma Ts'ien* (Paris, 1905), v, 40. Han-tan 邯鄲 was some ten *li* south-west of the present city by that name in southern Hopei.

<sup>3</sup> *K'ung Ts'ung-tzŭ* 孔叢子, 5/8a-b (Ssü-pu pei-yao ed.).